ASCS – Assessing Papers

Steffen Hölldobler
International Center for Computational Logic
Technische Universität Dresden
Germany

► How to

▷ assess a research paper
▷ prepare a research talk
▷ give a research talk
▷ write a research paper

"Logic is everywhere ..."
Assessment of Research Papers (1)

- Keith Stenning and Michiel van Lambalgen: Semantic Interpretation as Computation in Nonmonotonic Logic: The Real Meaning of the Suppression Task

- Is the suppression effect correctly and completely described?
- How precisely are the experiments specified?
- Have the experiments been repeated? If so, what are the results?
- Can you repeat the experiments?
- Did the authors cite the original work correctly?
- Are the given numbers correct?
Assessment of Research Papers (2)

- Are definitions crisp and clear?
- Are all notions used by the authors defined?
- Are the authors using notions as defined in the literature?
- Do they cite original literature?
- Are lemmas, theorems and propositions proven?
  - If yes, are the proofs correct?
  - If no,
    - do the authors refer to literature, where the results are proven?
    - can you prove the results?
    - are the results correct?
- Do the authors explain their decisions?
- Are the authors using notions as introduced?
Assessment of Research Papers (3)

- Is original work cited?
- Are the networks formally and completely specified?
- Can you repeat the constructions of the networks?
- Can you construct complete networks for other examples?
- Are claims made by the authors formally proven?
- Can all parts of the suppression task be modeled by neural networks?
Assessment of Research Papers (4)

► What is the contribution of the paper?
► How do you evaluate the originality of the paper?
► How do you evaluate the significance of the paper?
► Are results formally proven? Are the proofs correct?
► How well is a reader guided through the paper?
► Are the examples helpful? Are examples missing?
► How is the English?
► Did the authors cite relevant literature?